

**Devon and Cornwall Police Authority
Minutes**

A meeting of the **Chairs' Committee** was held on 16 April 2010 in the Conference Room, Endeavour House, Woodwater Park, Exeter starting at 12.30pm.

Present:

Chairman.... Mr M Bull

Mr B Preston, Mrs L Dunn, Mr B Greenslade, David Money and Mrs L Williams (observer)

Officers in Attendance: -

Police Authority Ms S Howl (Chief Executive) and Mrs E Tanner (Meeting Administrator)

Constabulary Mr S Sawyer (Deputy Chief Constable) Mr S Vry (Strategy Delivery Director).

C/158 Apologies for Absence

Apologies were received from Mr M Hicks.

C/159 Chairman's Announcements

The Chairman welcomed the newly appointed Deputy Chief Constable to the meeting. He also welcomed the Strategy Delivery Director.

C/160 Declarations of interest

The following declarations of interest were received.

Name	Agenda Item	Type of Interest	Details	Action
Mike Bull	Urgent item: Independent Members Appointments 2011	Personal & prejudicial	<ul style="list-style-type: none">N/A	Left the room
Lynne Dunn	Urgent item: Independent Member Appointments 2011	Personal & prejudicial	<ul style="list-style-type: none">N/A	Left the room

C/161 Items Requiring Urgent Attention

Having regard to the special circumstances pertaining to the following matters – namely:

- the need to confirm the appointment of HR services to the Authority with immediate effect; and
- the need to respond promptly to a member regarding the composition of the Independent Member Interview Panel,

the Chairman was of the opinion that despite their non-inclusion on the Agenda, the matters of HR Services for the Police Authority and the Independent Member Appointments 2011 should both be considered at the meeting as a matter of urgency.

These items were subsequently considered at the end of the open session.

C/162 Minutes

RESOLVED That the minutes of the meeting dated 12 March 2010 be agreed as a correct record.

Matters arising from the minutes included:

C/156 Update in respect of the Change 2012 Programme - It was confirmed that Ross Hislop would lead the Gateway Review of the 2012 Change programme. Ross Hislop had been picked from a list approved viewers held by the OGC who undertook similar reviews within the Civil Services as well as the previous 2012 Change Programme review for the Command and Control procurement.

C/157 Job and Grading Task and Finish Group update and Future Governance arrangements – At the previous meeting, Members had expressed concern about the governance arrangements following the proposal to integrate Job and Grading with the 2012 programme. As a result, in addition to the Chief Constable discussing arrangements with the Director of HR Director the Job and Grading Task and Finish Group (David Money and Linda Williams) had been requested to meet to consider their roles. The outcome of this meeting in short was that the proposal to integrate both programmes was supported however the Police Authority had to agree its own governance arrangements. It was **RESOLVED** to discuss this matter when considering the update in respect of the 2012 programme at item 9.

C/163 Independent Member Appointments Complaints Procedure

The APA / Home Office joint guidance 2008 on the selection and appointment of Independent Members recommends a complaint procedure for dealing with grievance, concern, or displeasure arising from the recruitment process for Independent Members. Members considered the proposed procedure.

Issues discussed during consideration of this item included:

- Advice had been sought from the Appointments Commission, an organisation with considerable expertise in recruiting for public appointments, when drawing up the complaints procedure.
- It was suggested that some clarity be provided in the procedure in regards to where the responsibility lay for determining a breach of appointment processes in the section dealing with appeal to the Standards Committee.
- At a recent meeting of the Selection Panel for the 2011 appointments, the Independent Assessor had commented that the Devon & Cornwall Police Authority's recruitment processes for Independent Members was 'exemplary' and had been used as an example of best practice to other Police Authorities.
- It was proposed that the Independent Assessor be requested to act as referee to validate any claims made about our recruitment processes in the forthcoming Inspection.
- It was suggested that the procedure be drawn to the attention on the Standards Committee.

RESOLVED that subject to the inclusion of named responsibility for determining a breach of appointment processes in the appeals section, the

- i. **Independent Member Appointments Complaint Procedure be adopted;**
- ii. **Standards Committee Terms of reference be amended to reflect the duty to deal with appeals against the handling of a complaint in relation to the Independent Member Appointments processes.**

C/164 Update on Equality and Diversity Training

Members were updated on the key actions regarding the implementation of the Equality and Diversity Training programme that was currently being delivered throughout the Constabulary. The report provided information relating to the progress being made towards the successful training of Sergeants and Superintendents which had been Phase 1 of the training, and that of Inspector / Chief Inspector, Police Staff and the Chief Officer group which was Phase 2. The reported showed that there were still some Sergeants and Superintendents who had not achieved competence to the required level and the list of these individuals had been passed to BCU Commanders / Department Heads for action and support.

Items discussed during consideration of this Item included:

- Members were unhappy about some aspects of the issues raised in the report and wanted to be kept up to date with progress which it was felt needed some further emphasis and urgency.
- Members expressed concern that there appeared to be some reluctance to undertake the training. In relation to the training for Sergeants, Members were reassured that the delay in achievement was mainly due to insufficient opportunity for evidence gathering, and delivery of the training to the number of people involved.
- In relation to the training for Superintendents, this reassurance was not readily available. The issue appeared to be a cultural one in that the Superintendent role, being removed from the front-line, was causing difficulties in terms of engagement with the process and evidence gathering. It was however understood that in general, Officers of Superintendent rank were keen to achieve the required competence. The Deputy Chief Constable was committed to dealing with this issue, and as recently elected Chair of the Force Diversity Board, would be taking this forward.
- Members requested a regular update on progress. The next meeting of the Authority's Diversity and Equality Working Group was scheduled for 11 May and it was anticipated that the situation would be clearer by then with the programme being 95% complete. A written report providing an update was requested for that meeting. It was proposed that this issue be a regular one on the agenda of the Equality and Diversity Working Group for the time being.
- Members requested the mechanism for tracking achievement and whether or not it was included in the Personal Development Reviews. Whilst it was known that it was included in the PDRs for Sergeants and Constables, the inclusion in Superintendents' PDRs required checking. This would be reported to the Authority at the Equality and Diversity Working Group in May.

RESOLVED that

- i. further reassurance on the delivery and achievement of Equality and Diversity training to the required competence be received by the Police Authority's Equality and Diversity Working Group on 11 May and that progress be reported to that group at every meeting until such time as Members are satisfied;**
- ii. the mechanism for recording achievement and ensuring compliance is identified and explained to the satisfaction of the Police Authority's Equality and Diversity Working Group**

C/165 Diversity and Equality Priorities

Members received a short report about the Authority's Single Equality Scheme. The Scheme would be presented to the Full Police Authority for ratification on 23 April. The Committee had approved the Terms of Reference of the Diversity and Equality Working Group which had been tasked with taking this work forward, however the priorities of the group had been queried. These were now provided for information.

Items discussed during consideration of this item included:

- The Single Equality Scheme that would be presented to the Authority had undergone some significant change to condense it down in size as a result of comments received from Members.
- There would follow a 12 week consultation period after its ratification on 23 April.
- It was important that the Police Authority be seen to take ownership of the scheme, and this would be addressed at the Police Authority on 23 April.

RESOLVED to endorse the priorities as set by the Diversity and Equality Working Group.

C/166 Independent Member Appointments

NOTE: Mr Mike Bull and Mrs L Dunn declared a prejudicial interest and left the room for this item.

Under delegated powers, the Chief Executive and Vice-Chairman had selected 3 Members to sit on the interviewing panel for the final interview stage of the Independent Member recruitment process commencing in September 2010. As a result of a request from a Member to review that decision and to increase the panel by one Councillor Member, the Chairs' Committee was asked to consider the Member's request and to approve or amend the composition of the panel.

Issues discussed during consideration of this item included:

- Precedent in terms of the number of Members on the interviewing panel. A panel of 3 Members is consistent with the past 2 rounds of Independent Member appointments.
- An interviewing panel of 4 would be problematic in the event of a tie in scores. A panel of 5 would result in 7 people being present at the interviews which would be unnecessarily intimidating for applicants.
- The panel as determined by the Chief Executive and Vice-Chairman comprised a Councillor, an Independent and a Lay Justice. This was considered to be balanced in respect of member group.
- It was requested that the minutes show the Chairman had no part in either the initial or subsequent decision in relation to this item.

RESOLVED that the interview panel to undertake interviews of the shortlist of applicants for recommendation to the full Police Authority for selection as Independent Members for the recruitment round commencing September 2010 be as follows:

**Mrs Lynda Price JP
Mr David Percival
Cllr Martyn Hodge**

C/167 HR Services for Devon and Cornwall Police Authority

Members considered a report that provided the processes undertaken by Police Authority Officers and Members in securing HR Services for the Police Authority subsequent to the planned retirement of the current HR Consultant.

Having considered the Contract Standing Orders, the Chief Executive reported that the analysis and assessment undertaken to underpin the appointments had been appropriate to the Authority's circumstances and both appointees had, or were going through, the appropriate vetting.

Issues discussed during consideration of this item included:

- There was some concern expressed about the monitoring of the work being carried out by the consultants, especially in relation to Job and Grading, now that this project had been incorporated into the 2012 programme. This was discussed in more detail during consideration of a related item later in the meeting.
- More information in relation to the background of one of the HR advisors was requested and provided.
- It was proposed that the Authority formally thank the vacating HR Consultant by way of a letter and presentation at a future seminar.

RESOLVED that

- Martin Denny be appointed as an Independent HR Advisor to the Authority in relation to the Job and Grading Project with immediate effect.**
- Julie Hall-Williams be appointed an Independent HR Advisor to the Authority with immediate effect.**

C/168 Consideration to Exclude the Press and Public

RESOLVED: that the items detailed in the table below be considered as closed items

Minute Number	Report Title	Relevant Act	Relevant section
C/169	Update in respect of the Devon & Cornwall Police Change Programme	Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (access to information Act 1985)	Schedule 12A, Paragraph 4. Information relating to any consultations or negotiations, or contemplated consultations or negotiations, in connection with any labour relations matter arising between the authority or a Minister of the Crown and employees of, or office holders under, the authority.
C/170	Police Authority Staffing Arrangements	Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (access to information Act 1985)	Schedule 12A, Paragraph 1. Information relating to any individual.

C/169 Update in respect of Devon and Cornwall 2012 Change Programme

Members were provided with an update in respect of activities within the 2012 Change Programme. The various parts of the programme were discussed in turn.

Items discussed during consideration of this item included:

- DCC Shaun Sawyer had taken the Senior Responsible Owner role for the whole 2012 Change Programme.

- Detailed results from the final tender submission were not yet available. There were well structured processes in place for the assessment of the final bids, and it was anticipated that the Committee would be requested to take a decision at their next meeting at the end of May.

Command and Control Project:

- The Systems Integrator which will be integrating the recently procured Command and Control system (Storm) with other Force systems (both existing and prospective) that will be selected via the SIS procurement by June 2010. The Command and Control system will not be installed until this is in place. A demonstration version of the system is being used in the control room for staff familiarisation purposes, however this has not been integrated with other parts of the network. There will be an opportunity for Members to see the overall solution design and get a flavour of what it can do when the preferred bidder had been selected.
- The Command and Control system will be fully functional either at the end of 2011, or later in 2012 depending on which bidder is selected. This is because one bidder has proposed the integration of the system as the first part of the implementation and the other as the last.
- Members queried the process that would be employed in regard to maintenance and problem management. There was a 3-level process in place, depending on the nature and severity of the problem and would involve SunGard, the successful SIS bidder and their sub-contractors as key players.
- There was concern about what would happen in the event of a system failure, and / or implementation failure, especially in light of past experience in relation to Airwave and IP2. Members were reassured that the lessons learnt as a result of past problems had been used to advise this procurement process and a system of service credits and the option to sue for costs (including the costs of re-procurement) had been put in place and legal advice had been provided throughout the procurement. Members asked for immediate notification of any problems in this respect.
-

Investigation and Intelligence Management Project:

- The scoring of responses received from bidders in relation to this part of the SIS procurement process was ongoing.
- A Member raised the issue of data quality and the minimum data standard and whether there would be something in place to ensure a minimum of information was recorded. This functionality would impress the need to get all required information in the beginning and reduce the need for additional information gathering. The need to go back for additional information could have a negative impact on the confidence target.
- There was a fine balance to be achieved in ensuring that the system was easy to use but rigorous enough to ensure good quality data without being overcomplicated or burdensome on front-line officers. It was anticipated that the system would have mandatory boxes and optional boxes to ensure data was useable and there would be some data matching to limit contradictory information being entered.

Duty Management System:

- Bids were being scored. There was opportunity for significant overtime savings as a result of better resource management.

Corporate Services Transformation:

- The CST project was launched to make services such as HR and Learning and Development, Finance and Resources, Business Change and ICT, and IT more efficient and effective. Phase 1 of the project has delivered over £2m of savings per annum. As part of the 2012 Change Programme, potential bidders had been asked to provide quotes on a range of services, including those impacting on these back office functions. Much improvement had already been achieved however the next steps which involved improvements to technology and processes were dependent on affordability as a result of the Solutions and Integration Services procurement.
- One ongoing project was looking at options costs and savings for corporate services via regional collaboration across the four regional forces outside of Southwest one (Avon & Somerset were not included since they had a contract with SW1).
- The CST project carried out by Devon & Cornwall had been acknowledged as a model process and the Chief Constable had offered this experience to other Police Forces looking at undertaking similar projects. The four SW Forces not in SW1 are sharing the costs of the initial assessment stage, £12,500 each.

Systems Integration and Solutions Procurement:

- Of the range of components and systems being considered as part of the 2012 Change Programme only a few were considered mandatory. Members were provided with a list of these marked as mandatory or optional as appropriate. Once bids had been received, decisions on what to purchase could be made based on affordability.
- Members were given an overview of the complexity of the procurement processes and the number of people and teams involved in assessing the bids resulting in a recommendation to the Chairs' Committee in May.
- One of the key issues was around the need to seek further clarification from bidders. Currently, none could be confirmed to be completely compliant. At the end of the process, contingencies around de-scoping the programme were a possibility should problems with compliance or affordability remain.
- In the light of the current financial situation it was queried whether any programmes had costs included that were not necessary and whether similar benefits could be delivered at a lower cost. There was concern that some solutions could be at the expense of officer numbers. If de-scoping was a possibility as a worse-case scenario, had this been considered at the outset? This came down to the balance of affordability versus benefit or investment cost versus benefits lost by not buying in.
- It was queried whether or not capital financing charges had been built in to the savings identified. Benefits had been calculated on net present value contribution to ensure a return on investment that was satisfactory. There was an element of risk because savings would not be guaranteed at the outset and their realisation came after the investment would have to be made however it was believed that those bidders that remained could deliver better value for money systems but affordability and scope / capacity for change remained key issues. A key opportunity was integration. Integration could deliver significant benefits in terms of money and time but until the systems were successfully delivered no savings would be achieved.
- There was a Gateway Review and a review by the Police Authority's Independent Assessor David Wilkin, recommendations to the Programme Board would follow on 27 May and the Task and Finish Group on 24 May prior to the Chairs' Committee at the end of May.
- Members were impressed with the auditable processes involved in the programme.

Desktop Migration Project & Programme Financial Reporting:

- Members were updated on progress towards the updating of the operating system to Windows XP and the desktop software from MS Office 1997.
- It was confirmed that for the first time the Force has a costed long term plan (roadmap) for all change. The plan spanned 7 years and included staffing, IT, telecoms, software licences, hardware and software issues. The plan was based on an estimation of requirements and costs and included a contingency provision. Savings identified in the financial plan were based only on known maintenance and licence costs that would no longer need to be paid. Therefore any cash benefits delivered would be a bonus and decisions would be needed about their use in due course.

Blueprint / Detailed Vision Statement:

- Work was ongoing to identify the priorities and a report was due to the Chief Officer Group in July. There may result some structural change, key issues included dual patrol / single patrol and policing management structures.
- It was important that Members needed to understand what the picture is for the future.

Benefits Management:

- Members requested that the vision in the Programme Benefits table be updated to show that the Force aimed to be a Top Tenperforming Force.
- Qualitative and quantitative information was being pulled together for consideration by the Police Authority in June with an outline for the Chairs' Committee in May, and following the selection of the preferred bidder. This issue will be reported to the Chairs' Committee on an on-going basis.

There were no issues raised in relation to Mobile Data, Leadership and Quest.

Job and Grading:

- The Force Programme Board had accepted JAG into the change programme on 15 April, and JAG would be reported to this Committee in the 2012 Programme report.
- The Governance structure had yet to be determined, both by the Police Authority and the Police.
- Although part of the programme, JAG was to be financially managed as a separate entity, with ring-fenced funding.
- A proposal arising from the Project Board was that JAG would be renamed Job Evaluation.

Members raised the following issues:

- The renaming of JAG to JE was of considerable concern to Members, both in terms of staff reaction and that of the public because of its association with the previous JE exercise. There was a general consensus against the use of this terminology.
- There was concern about the reporting to the Authority on JAG as part of the 2012 programme; it was suggested that a representative from HR should be present. The Governance arrangements were still to be approved, and the Force's proposal was to lead by the business, and not by HR. It was still possible that JAG would be considered as a separate issue, and remain in the 2012 programme. It was proposed that the Chairman and the Chairman of HR discuss this with the Chief Constable.
- The Job and Grading Task and Finish Group had discussed the governance arrangements with the Chief Executive and the Director of HR. As a result of these discussions there was some concerns about the following:
 - that the Police Authority could lose focus on JAG as a result of it being subsumed into 2012 programme

- That the 2012 Programme was a systems and processes issue whilst JAG was about people.
- That it could be problematic monitoring and advising the involvement of the Police Authority's HR Advisor for JAG.
- It was proposed that the 2012 Task and Finish Group would benefit from the knowledge and expertise of the HR Committee leadership and that of the JAG Task and Finish Group and to that end the David Money and Linda Williams would be welcomed onto that group.
- Following considerable debate, it was agreed that it was not possible to decide the governance arrangements for the Police Authority until the Force had resolved their own arrangements. The Deputy Chief Constable was keen to work closely with the Police Authority to ensure that whatever arrangements were agreed, they were acceptable to both the Force and the Authority.

RESOLVED that

- i. **The Authority be immediately notified in the event of any concern identified in relation to the implementation of the Command and Control System.**
- ii. **The Chief Executive work with the Deputy Chief Constable and the JAG Task and Finish Group to draw up complementary governance arrangements in relation to the JAG programme for submission to a future meeting of the Chairs Committee for onward approval by the full Police Authority.**

C/170 Police Authority Staffing Arrangements

Members considered the report. The Chairman supported the recommendation.

RESOLVED

- i. To update the Administrative Officer – Independent Custody Visiting job description to accurately reflect the level of duties being carried out by the current post-holder and to re-grade the post to Scale 4 with effect from 1 January 2010.
- ii. To pay an honorarium of £200 to Jennifer Townsend in recognition of the additional responsibility of first-line supervision of PALM Administrators during 2009.

The meeting closed at 13.00 pm.

Signed (Chairman)

Date: